## ROCZNIK BEZPIECZEŃSTWA MORSKIEGO ROK XIV – 2020

## Adrian Mitrega

Uniwersytet Jana Kochanowskiego, Kielce

## THE STRATEGY OF WAGING HYBRID WARFARE IN THE 21ST CENTURY

#### ABSTRACT

Over the last decade, the concept of hybrid warfare has aroused great interest among the global community dealing with security issues, both military, and non-military. The specificity of hybrid warfare is that the fight is not for territories, but for the minds, and attitudes of citizens of other countries, and the means of combat are very sophisticated. Any hybrid war is based on a strategy that involves achievement victory by setting goals, overall plan and systematic impact on enemy's vulnerabilities using a hybrid threat complex. In connection with the above, the aim of the article is to present the role of the strategy in waging hybrid warfare, as well as in developing mechanisms to counteract hybrid threats.

#### **Key words:**

hybrid warfare, strategy, counter-strategy

#### INTRODUCTION

The weakening of the contemporary global security system, its deformation, and fragmentation lead to increasing chaos in international relations. International conflicts are growing, network forms of international terrorism, and organized crime are on the rise. One of the consequences of the emerging crisis in international relations is the emergence of a new type of conflict involving non-military means aimed at achieving political, and strategic goals<sup>238</sup>.

Over the last decade, the concept of hybrid warfare has aroused great interest among the global community dealing with security issues, both military,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> Războaie hibride în clasificarea căruțelor. Războiul hibrid ca un nou tip de război al viitorului. Natura nestatală a războiului hibrid, https://srcaltufevo.ru/ro/gibridnye-voiny-v-klassifikacii-voz-gibridnaya-voina-kak-novyi-tip-voiny.html, access: 05.05.2020.

and non-military. It is believed that the theory of hybrid warfare was first proposed by Frank Hoffman, an American military expert. However, when analysing the activities typical of hybrid warfare, one can see that such conflicts have accompanied mankind for a long time, only the tools of its waging have changed over the centuries<sup>239</sup>. Nowadays, hybrid warfare has become a popular, and effective type of warfare, in which conventional military operations combine traditional combat operations with unconventional operations to weaken the enemy<sup>240</sup>.

The aim of the article is to present the role of the strategy in waging hybrid warfare, as well as in developing mechanisms to counteract hybrid threats<sup>241</sup>. In turn, the main research problem took a form of the question: What role does the strategy play in waging hybrid wars, and how do countries develop counter-strategies to counter hybrid threats? The hypothesis that the author verified during the argument was the assumption that each hybrid warfare is conducted according to a previously developed strategy that combines the actions of military, and non-military institutions to develop a model of conflict management in order

239 The king of France Louis XIV (1643-1715) is considered to be the originator of "hybrid warfare". In preparation for the War of the Palatine Succession (1688-1697) he, among others, pointed out that it would not be convenient to directly operate on the German lands, but with the help of German princes dependent on him. In case of defeat, France could reject them without prejudice to prestige. Hence the main principle of French politics of the next century emerged: the creation of regional balances of power by using small countries (to the point of making palace coups in them), and pitting them against the great powers. French actions were based on several principles:

- Firstly, the main task was not to destroy the enemy, but to force him to compromise.
- Secondly, a certain theatre of war was chosen, in which there were wars between great powers, and at the same time war could not be waged on their territory.
- Thirdly, the wars of this period were characterized by the lack of continuous battlefront, and relatively rare clashes between troops.
- Fourthly, great powers often acted behind the backs of other countries.
- Fifthly, "succession wars" were generally waged by small professional armies.
- Sixthly, French diplomacy mastered the technology of "palace coups" well. The
  establishment of Versailles-friendly regimes in the German states, Sweden, the
  Commonwealth, the Ottoman Empire, and even in Russia became the prologue to the
  outbreak of the Great War.

А. Фененко. Какими будут войны будушего?.

https://globalaffairs.ru/articles/kakimi-budut-vojny-budushhego/, access: 03.05.2020.

05/23/c\_1210142001.htm, access: 03.08.2020.

<sup>241</sup> Hybrid threats refer to a wide range of methods, or actions used by a hostile state, or non-state actors in a coordinated manner to combat weaknesses in democratic states, and institutions, while remaining below the threshold of formally declared war. Some examples include cyberattacks, interference in elections, and disinformation campaigns, including on social media. Hybrid threats aim at taking advantage of a country's weaknesses, and often seek to undermine fundamental democratic values and freedoms. *Joint Communication to the European Parliament and the Council - Joint Framework to counter hybrid threats - the European Union response*, JOIN / 2016/018 final

to achieve political, and strategic goals by depriving the enemy of the ability to fight, influencing directly not only the military, but also political, economic, information, scientific, technical, moral, cultural, demographic, and ecological capabilities of the enemy. In addition, countries, along with the development of hybrid threats, are trying to develop mechanisms to counteract hybrid warfare, which we can consider as a counter-strategy of hybrid warfare.

### STRATEGY - GENESIS, DEFINITIONS, THE ESSENCE OF THE CONCEPT

The term "strategy" had already existed several centuries before Christ, and with the development of mankind, this concept evolved from a strictly military term to the term commonly referring to the achievement of an intended goal with the use of forces, and means.

Strategy in its original sense, but also valid in modern times, was, and is, a field of the art of warfare<sup>242</sup> while remaining superior to e.g. tactics, or operational level of war. However, despite the fact that the conceptual scope of this term was constantly expanding, as indicated, among others, by B. Balcerowicz<sup>243</sup> thus, also in contemporary, and numerous studies, "strategy" is characterized as a branch of the art of warfare, which is contained both in theory, and practice. In theoretical dimension, it deals with the study of general regularities (laws) of wars, current views of probable opponents, and their ways of waging war, their military, economic, demographic potential, etc. The strategy also deals with determining the conditions, and nature of possible future war. In turn, in the practical dimension, the task of the strategy was, among others, to conduct strategic reconnaissance, develop war plans, implement plans to expand the armed forces, as well as study theatres of warfare<sup>244</sup>.

Nowadays, as a result of faster development of science, technology, economics, and many other sciences, as well as socio-political changes, the strategy is also evolving. So we can now talk about the strategy of economic development, foreign policy strategy, security strategy in various fields, but also the development strategy of an enterprise, the development strategy of a commune, the strategy used by the director during the production of a film, the strategy of a chess master playing a given chess game, as well as many others<sup>245</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>242</sup>S. Koziej, *The theory of art of warfare*, Bellona Publishing House, Warsaw 2011, p. 29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>243</sup>B. Balcerowicz, *Armed forces in a state of peace, crisis, war*, Scholar Academic Publishing, Warsaw

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup>K. Nożko, *The issues of contemporary art of warfare*, Publishing House of the Ministry of National Defence, Warsaw 1973, pp. 102-103; A. Polak, Strategy, i.e. about the border between the art of warfare and politics, "Kwartalnik Bellona" 2013, No. 1, p. 109.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>245</sup>M. Kozub, A. Mitrega, Fundamentals of security strategy. Selected aspects, Jan Kochanowski University, Kielce 2018, p. 109.

According to the definition in the dictionary of the National Defence University (currently the War Studies University), strategy is a theory, and practice that defines the ways of thinking, and actions of representatives of the highest authorities in a given field, characterized by a high degree of generalization, a large time horizon, and the ability to obtain resources to achieve the assumed goals<sup>246</sup>. It should be added, however, that there is no one universal definition of strategy<sup>247</sup>. However, depending on the approach, the purpose of the definition, and the area of application, strategy may mean:

- 1) The purpose, and method of using force in political actions (the concept of force, in this approach, should not only be equated with the military, as force may occur in any field of politics, and each area has its own means, and resources of force).
- 2) The level of defining the purpose, and method of functioning of the organization (element of the axiological, and normative basis of organization management, defining the general way of functioning of the organization (entity) as a whole, or in relation to domains / areas / functions / products / sub-entities).
- 3) The level of defining the purpose, and method of implementing a complex action (action strategy), an ordered set (system) of interrelated assumptions, and decisions defining the entity's operation to the extent necessary, and sufficient for its identification, and standardization of preparatory and implementation processes<sup>248</sup>.

Strategy, in its military sense, most often consists in finding a rational way to destroy the enemy's armed forces, which was achieved by performing an appropriate manoeuvre, allowing to gain an advantage, destroying enemy groups with fire, and striking at a convenient place and time using the element of surprise. However, it should be noted, that today the strategy of using the armed forces, i.e. the military strategy, will not always be about looking for ways to rationally destroy the enemy's military potential, especially that in the 21st

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>246</sup>Glossary of terms in the field of national security, National Defence University, Warsaw 2008, p.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>247</sup>According to W. Łepkowski, "Strategy is a theory, and practice that defines ways of thinking, as well as actions with a very high degree of generalization, as well as a large time horizon; in addition, it defines the skills of effective obtaining of resources to achieve the assumed goals". W. Łepkowski, Fundamentals of military strategy, National Defence University, Warsaw 2006, p. 46. Antoine-Henri Jomini, who in one of his works, namely "An outline of the art of warfare", identified strategy with the art of leading the main forces of the army to the most important point of a theatre of war, or an operational level of war. On the other hand, R. Niedźwiecki believes that the strategy has gained the definition of a set of coordinated actions, skilful operations, and all manoeuvres aimed at achieving a strictly defined goal. R. Niedźwiecki, Evolution of strategy. Towards an integrated security strategy, National Defence University, Warsaw 2013, p. 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup>M. Kozub, A. Mitrega, Fundamentals of security strategy. Selected aspects, Jan Kochanowski University, Kielce 2018, p. 131.

century the armed forces are a significant element of deterring the enemy from aggression, they conduct non-military actions aimed at restoring, or stabilizing peace<sup>249</sup>.

Strategy is also a way of thinking that also has its own specificity. In theory, thinking, and acting should be one, because every rational action is preceded by a thought<sup>250</sup>. In turn, the success of the strategy depends mainly on the correct adjustment of a goal to the means. The goal must be consistent with the total amount of means available, and the means used to achieve each milestone towards the end goal must correspond to the assumptions made. It should be added, that an excess amount of means can be just as damaging as a lack of means<sup>251</sup>.

In order to develop a strategy, a state, or an organization implementing it uses strategic intelligence services<sup>252</sup> extensively, thanks to this, the strategic planning process takes place on the basis of a detailed list of the national potential, as well as a list of the forces, and means of a potential enemy. Having the necessary information at the strategic level, it is possible to forecast the development of future events, and their effects, also strategic information should be constantly monitored<sup>253</sup>.

It should be added, that in the process of developing strategies for contemporary conflicts, two models are used – rational and irrational. A rational strategy is expressed in the ability to clearly formulate the meaning, and goals of an armed conflict, to determine the probable nature of a war, to serve as a guide for strategic forecasting, and preparation of the state, and its armed forces for war by creating the necessary forces, and means in advance, to ensure

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>249</sup>*Glossary of terms in the field of national security*, op. cit., p. 127.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>250</sup>W. Pokruszyński, *Politics and security strategy*, Alcide De Gasperi University of Euroregional Economy, Józefów 2011, p. 44.

<sup>251</sup> Основы военной стратегии и большой стратегии,

http://militera.lib.ru/science/liddel\_hart1/19.html, access: 14.09.2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>252</sup>The term "strategic intelligence" suggests that it is a process of collecting, and providing information necessary for state institutions to implement foreign policy, and tasks in the field of national security in a state of peace and war. For the state to perform these functions, the information should be reliable, valid and timely. During an armed conflict, the role of strategic intelligence is clear and obvious – it consists in providing information support for fighting at every level. In the state of peace, the area of interest is much wider, and difficult to define. Strategic intelligence collects virtually all information, covering various areas of reality – political, economic, social, scientific, and technical, sociological, cultural, military, etc. In each of these areas something happens every day, and many of these events are significant for the decisions made by politicians, and state administration. The selection of this information is one of the tasks of the strategic intelligence institution. R.H. Mathams, *The intelligence Analyst's Notebook* [at:] *Strategic Intelligence: Theory and Application*, ed. D. H. Dearth, R.T. Goodden, Washington 1995, p. 77; M. Minkina, The *Art of Intelligence in a Contemporary State*, Bellona, Warsaw 2014, p. 30.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> J. Boone Bartholomees, *Theory of War and Strategy*, U.S. Army War College, Carlisle 2010.

that reliable and complete information is obtained about strategic views of the military, and political leadership of the leading countries and coalitions, about their ability to prepare, unleash, and conduct hostilities<sup>254</sup>.

However, armed conflict strategies should take into account the moments of obvious irrationality characteristic of international, and national political life, expressed in the chaos of relations, domination of emotions, which, under high pressure, constitute a combination of unpredictable, irrational decisions. As a result, the strategy is less consistent with the goal, it loses its ability to regulate the armed conflict, which leads to disorganization. The Russian philosopher Nikolai Berdyaev wrote that "the combination of what is irrational, and rational is characteristic of our era (...) There is an explosion of irrational forces, as a result of which a man drowns"<sup>255</sup>.

#### THE EVOLUTION OF HYBRID WALRFARE IN THE 21ST CENTURY

War has been the main instrument of foreign policy throughout human history. And it was the need for constant participation in armed conflicts that determined practically all aspects of public life, as well as the economic development of countries. The war also contributed to the development of technology, and scientific discoveries<sup>256</sup>.

In 2002, military analyst William Nemeth was the first to talk about hybrid wars<sup>257</sup> in connection with the ongoing Second Chechen War. It was he who stated that the Chechen rebels used both modern technologies, and modern methods of mobilization against the Russian army, and depending on the situation, they used conventional, or guerrilla tactics, the latter of which could turn into terrorism<sup>258</sup>. In 2005, US Vice Admiral James Mattis, and military scholar Frank Hoffman wrote articles in the *US Naval Journal* proposing the theory of "hybrid warfare"<sup>259</sup>. Two years later, F. Hoffman published a book *Conflicts in the 21st Century: The Rise of Hybrid Wars*, in which he discusses

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>254</sup> Хаос вооруженного противоборства. Рациональное и иррациональное в стратегии гибридной войны, http://blackseafleet-21.com/news/18-07-2019\_haos-vooruzhennogo-protivoborstva-ratsionalnoe-i-irratsionalnoe-v-strategii-gibridnoj-voj, access: 20.08.2020.
<sup>255</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>256</sup> Две модели организации тыла, https://strateg.org/dve-modeli-organizacii-tyla.html, access: 24.10.2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>257</sup>The emergence of "hybrid warfare" is not the product of experts, but the inevitable result of the evolution of the international security situation, as well as of the evolution of warfare.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>258</sup> W. J. Nemeth, *Future war and Chechnya: A case for hybrid warfare*, http://calhoun.nps.edu/bitstream/handle/10945/5865/02Jun\_Nemeth.pdf?sequence=1, access: 12.09.2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>259</sup> J. N. Mattis, F. Hoffman, *Future Warfare: The Rise of Hybrid Wars*, ,"United States Naval Institute Proceedings", 2005, vol. 131, no. 11.

"hybrid wars". Based on the analysis of factors, such as globalization, and technological proliferation, he concluded that the form of modern warfare is changing from the traditional "large-scale war", or "small-scale informal war" to one in which the boundaries are more blurred<sup>260</sup>. The further development, and improvement of the hybrid warfare theory was made by General Valery Gerasimov, chief of the General Staff of the Russian army. In 2013, V. Gerasimov, in his article *The value of science in forecasting,* called on Russia to use the multipronged tactic of "hybrid warfare" in the field of military, technology, media, politics, and intelligence, at minimal cost<sup>261</sup>.

Considering the issue of hybrid warfare, it should be noted, that hybridity is a feature of every war, because the opposing sides try to use all the forces, means, and methods of warfare at their disposal. Today, the concept of "hybridity" reflects significant changes in the nature of modern wars, which are diverse, and military operations in the event of a conflict with a technologically advanced enemy can be carried out both in known environments – on land, at sea, and in the air, as well as in new areas – space, and cybernetic. An important feature of modern wars is also multidimensionality, which means a combination of informational, military, financial, economic, and diplomatic influence on the enemy in real time.

The specificity of hybrid warfare is that the fight is not for territories, but for the minds, and attitudes of citizens of other countries, and the means of combat are very sophisticated. Therefore, hybrid warfare is a confrontation between states in which one of them tries to subdue the other in various ways: economic, informational, historical, etc.<sup>262</sup>. In a hybrid warfare, a state, or a coalition which is able to impose on the defeated its vision, related values, and interests, an understanding of the "fair" distribution of resources corresponding to their worldview, wins the war. Hybrid warfare allows to solve the problem of ensuring access to the resources of another state with a minimum level of violence in the military sphere, and based on economic, information, and psychological coercion to cooperate on the terms of the winner<sup>263</sup>.

It should be noted, that since the beginning of the 21st century, much attention has been paid to the study of hybrid wars, and their strategies in the United States, and the North Atlantic Alliance. Taking into account the multidimensionality of the conflict, military leaders, and politicians assume that,

193

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>260</sup> F. Hoffman, *Conflict in the 21st Century: The Rise of Hybrid Wars*, Potomac Institute for Policy Studies, Arlington 2007, p. 8.

 $<sup>^{261}</sup>$  В. Герасимов, *Ценность науки в предвидении*, https://www.vpk-news.ru/articles/14632, access: 03.05.2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>262</sup> Evgheni Mahda: "Specificul unui război hibrid este că lupta se dă nu pentru teritorii, ci pentru mințile și atitudinele cetățenilor altor state, https://moldova.europalibera.org/a/27738877.html, access: 12.09.2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>263</sup> A.A. Bartosh, *Dialectic of hybrid warfare*, "Philosophical thought "2017, no. 12, pp. 53-68.

given the fundamental role of armed forces in hybrid wars, states should pool their governments, military, and intelligence efforts under the auspices of the United States in a "comprehensive intergovernmental, and international strategy", and to use the methods of political, economic, military, and psychological pressure as effectively as possible.

The most frequently discussed example of hybrid war is Russia's actions against Ukraine. From February 24 to March 21, 2014, Russia used various methods to conquer the Crimea, which shocked NATO. First, Russia mobilized the propaganda machine to mobilize the pro-Russian moods of the local Russians, the next step was to use Russian special forces, which, when camouflaged, did not reveal their nationality. At critical moments, intelligence personnel disrupted the Ukrainian command system, and the Russian army took control of the most important sites on the Crimean Peninsula. In a few days, Russia organized a referendum in the Crimea and, based on the voting results, announced the Crimea's incorporation into Russia. In practice, Russia applied the theory of "mixed war", and took away the Crimea, which became a typical example of the application of this theory<sup>264</sup>.

Hybrid warfare is believed to be a proxy war, in which traditional political warfare is mixed with irregular, cyber, and psychological war. This hybrid fight is intended to change the mindset of the citizens of the attacked country. Rumours, misinformation, and fake news are spread as part of this type of conflict. Thus, the thinking of the general public begins to change. In the age of the Internet, and social media, it's easier than ever.

Hybrid conflicts of a non-classical nature with the participation of armed formations of non-state actors, including international terrorism, private military companies, characterized by unclear national, and ideological affiliation, fully confirm their multidimensionality. The attitude of military, and non-military methods of operation of the parties to conflicts is changing. Non-military measures of violence in hybrid warfare include traditional, and public diplomacy, legal, economic, ideological, and psychological, information, humanitarian, intelligence, technological, and other instruments of influence. M. Fryc believes, for example, that hybrid war is directed at achieving strategic goals. A whole range of various means, both tangible, and intangible, military and non-military, legal and illegal, direct and indirect, is used for this. In its essence, it therefore takes on a total dimension. Then he selects them appropriately, and combines them into actions so that they bring the intended results. Thus, all available means (political, diplomatic, military, informational, economic, and cultural) are used, which constitute a direct threat, and indirect pressure with

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>264</sup>Crimea presented a Russian version of "mixed war", http://military.people.com.cn/BIG5/n1/2020/0409/c1011-31667237.html, access: 09.09.2020.

limited actions using armed force<sup>265</sup>. It is important to emphasize, that the space of influence is of great importance in hybrid warfare. Unlike traditional warfare, it is not limited to the physical dimension, but is present in other dimensions, in which until now the regular armed forces have not acted<sup>266</sup>.

### Special features of hybrid warfare

Firstly, it is a new quality of complex warfare, and multinational threats. In particular, individual states, but also interest groups, try to achieve their goals below the threshold of conventional war in the light of international law.

Secondly, it is a synergistic use of overt and hidden, regular and irregular, symmetrical and asymmetrical, military and non-military means of violence, through the least possible use of own forces and means, and with the least possible losses in order to enforce specific interests, or "victory" over the opponent.

Thirdly, it is a multi-layered way of fighting that differs from the existing rules of the art of war. The entities participating in it try to resolve territorial, ethnic, and religious conflicts, primarily through terrorist activities, and criminal behaviour.

Fourthly, hybrid warfare will be expanded in the future through the use of cyber warfare, and other methods of modern combat operations. The armed conflict in the virtual space of states, and non-state actors reveals a paradigm shift in (military) strategy, namely the departure from destroying the enemy in "close contact" towards strategic, possibly preventive paralysis of the strength potential of the enemy, or civil society<sup>267</sup>.

A special feature of hybrid warfare is its "obfuscation" tactic. The perpetrators either act anonymously, or deny involvement in incidents and conflicts. They are extremely creative, and coordinated, not crossing the threshold of official war. This is what makes defending against such attacks especially difficult: if there is no clear attack, or attacker, countering is difficult<sup>268</sup>.

https://www.bmvg.de/de/themen/sicherheitspolitik/hybride-bedrohungen/was-sind-hybride-bedrohungen--13692, access: 08.10.2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>265</sup>M. Fryc, *Polish defence strategy against a military threat with elements of "hybrid war"*, "National Security" 2015, No. I, p. 65.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>266</sup>M. Banasik, *Polish perspective on hybrid war*, "Defence – Scientific Papers of the Faculty of Management and Command of the War Studies University" 2016, No. 16, p. 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>267</sup> Der hybride Krieg - eine neue Qualität komplexer Kriegführung und multinationaler Bedrohung? Eine Einschätzung der russischen Sicht, https://www.oemz-

online.at/display/ZLIintranet/Der+hybride+Krieg

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>268</sup> Was sind hybride Bedrohungen?,

#### STRATEGY AND COUNTER-STRATEGY IN HYBRID WARFARE

A hybrid warfare strategy is a way to achieve victory by setting goals, overall plan, and systematic impact on enemy's vulnerabilities using a hybrid threat complex. The strategy in hybrid war is planned for a long period of time, and covers the territory of the entire state. The hybrid war strategy assumes a transition to open use of force, often only at the end stage of the conflict, using the existing legal, and regulatory framework for peacekeeping, and crisis management operations. This is an important factor that requires a qualitative modification of the indicators determining the new generation of armed conflicts, and their strategies. Contrary to anti-terrorist operations, a significant number of which is carried out in a short time, the time frames of planning, implementing, and coordinating actions in hybrid warfare require a much longer period of time. Moreover, if the destruction of a terrorist network, or the capture of leaders can serve as a convincing measure of the success of an anti-terrorist operation, then there are less obvious indicators in hybrid warfare. In general, when preparing to participate in hybrid warfare, an appropriate long-term political strategy is created as a basis for fighting the enemy<sup>269</sup>.

The purpose of the hybrid war strategy is to weaken the target country. This involves a series of operations involving the use of both military, and non-military forces and means. At the same time, as part of a unified attempt and plan, operations that disrupt the economy, communication systems, and world view are carried out. The aggressor state secretly attacks the governmental agencies of the target country, and targets in the fields of economic, information and cultural, and world view without a formal declaration of war, as well as attacks against law enforcement services, and regular forces. Then, in a decisive phase, it decides to engage in military operations with the participation of local insurgents, mercenaries, and private military companies, which received support in the form of the aggressor's special forces, weapons, and funds<sup>270</sup>.

The development, and implementation of the hybrid war strategy includes the following steps:

- *The first* is to clearly formulate the meaning, and purpose of the war.
- *The second* is the disclosure of weaknesses, and vulnerabilities in the sphere of ensuring internal, and external security of the hostile state.
- *The third* is to create a set of hybrid threats, taking into account the local specificity, aimed at influencing the object of aggression.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>269</sup> Războaie hibride în clasificarea căruțelor. Războiul hibrid ca un nou tip de război al viitorului. Natura nestatală a războiului hibrid, op. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>270</sup> A. A Bartosz, *Mixed war strategy and counter-strategy*, "Military thought", 2018, no.10.

- The fourth is strategic planning based on the specific use of forces, and means aimed at showing the weakness of the enemy in the political and administrative, financial and economic, cultural and ideological spheres, as well as the analysis of the expected counteraction (probable counterstrategy).
- The fifth, a consistent destructive influence on the key spheres of government in the attacked country, focusing mainly on the most critical factors ensuring the country's military security (economy, finances, morale of the army, and population).
- The sixth is the deployment of undeclared armed forces, during which the aggressor state attacks the state structures, and the enemy's regular army with the help of local rebels and separatists, backed by weapons, and funds from abroad. An important place is occupied by the activities of the "fifth column", which take on an extremist character, which are used to ram the authorities in the course of one, or more "colour revolutions".
- The seventh, to deliver an ultimatum demanding complete submission of the victim state<sup>271</sup>.

An important element of the strategy is the targeted influence on the state's military security in order to involve it in exorbitant, exhausting military expenses by provoking local conflicts in border areas, and strategically important regions, conducting mass military exercises on its borders according to provocative scenarios, placing destabilizing weapon systems, possibilities of the "fifth column", and agent networks.

The strategy of a hybrid military conflict has three different dimensions, determined by its multidimensionality factor, as well as time and space factors. Multidimensionality means combining information, military, financial, economic, and diplomatic influence on the enemy in real time. The time factor is related to the duration of the impact on the enemy during the implementation of the destruction strategy, and the spatial factor – with the simultaneous coverage of the strategy of the entire territory of the country. The factors conditioning the effective use of hybrid warfare include a serious crisis in the target country, the existence of national, or religious minorities in the attacked country, which constitute a significant part of society, and identify with the aggressor, the possibility of reaching the society of the attacked country with a propaganda message<sup>272</sup>. These measurements, in turn, determine the scope, and content of measures to counter hybrid warfare (counter-strategy).

According to the Collins English Dictionary, from 1936 to the beginning of the 21st century, the use of the term "counter-strategy" in military research was

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>271</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>272</sup> Ł. Skoneczny, *Hybrid warfare - a challenge of the future? Selected issues,* "Internal Security Review, Special edition, 2015, p. 49.

very low, but since 2006 the term has been mentioned many times. It is initially estimated, that this is due to the rapid increase in the number of research on the strategy of hybrid warfare, which results from the multi-domain nature of the war itself, requiring the comprehensive use of several types of violence against the attacked state: military, financial, economic, political, informational, and cybernetic. At the same time, while the actions of the armed forces are important, they are only part of the confrontation<sup>273</sup>.

The counter-strategy of hybrid warfare should form the basis of an overall plan for the implementation of countermeasures against enemy attack, taking into account the constantly changing situations, and political conditions. Its development should be based on data from all intelligence sources. In addition to revealing the general project of hybrid war, and its specificity, the task of the intelligence (counterintelligence) should be to obtain information about hidden "subversives" who operate in a network of isolated cells in the territory of the attacked country. In this context, in critical regions, it can be useful to create reconnaissance groups, and strike forces with their own operational, reliable, and secret communication channels. The main attention should be paid to the disclosure of the following enemy actions:

- seeking the sources of sustainable financing for the protest movement, and then for armed formations, both from external interested forces, and the use of internal capabilities;
- *identification of extremist political groups, and associations* capable of participating in planned violent operations;
- *defining practical slogans* that can be used to undermine the legitimacy of the existing government;
- *training leaders capable of leading a political protest* with the ultimate goal of a coup d'état;
- *training in specialized militant camps,* organizing mobilization points abroad, and transfer of mercenaries;
- the use of domestic, and foreign electronic media, which play an important role in gaining support from international organizations, and communities;
- *organization of network structures for subversive management,* procurement, communication, and situation monitoring<sup>274</sup>.

When developing a counter-strategy, it is important to properly define the schedule of retaliatory, and preventive actions in all areas of the anticipated enemy strike, including bringing the armed forces, and other state structures to the appropriate level of readiness, strengthening intelligence, and counter-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>273</sup>A.A Bartosz, *Mixed war strategy and counter-strategy,* op. cit. <sup>274</sup> Ibidem.

intelligence activities, as well as solving many other counter-aggression tasks that are based on a destruction strategy.

Based on the characteristics, and capabilities of the counter-strategy against aggressive attacks, it is advisable to develop the counter-strategy as a separate, and self-sufficient program for the development of defence, and protective measures. When creating a system of defence, and protection actions, and in the future a systemic counter-strategy, countries should take into account the specificity of the current global situation in which the United States aims to maintain military, economic, and financial leadership. Russia wants to regain its influence in Central and Eastern Europe, and also increase its influence on the countries of the European Union. China, in turn, is trying to oust the US from Southeast Asia, and to dethrone the US from the position of the most powerful country in the world.

In order to develop an effective counter-strategy, it should be noted, that in preparing the state, and its armed forces to face the threats of our time, including hybrid threats, strategic forecasts play an important role as the basis for making political, and military decisions. The strategic forecast should include an assessment of risks, and threats to national security. Such forecast may be based on a goal-problem approach in which extrapolation<sup>275</sup> of the future observed development trends of the studied phenomena gives an overview of emerging problems, and helps in finding effective solutions. It is important that the forecast takes into account the risk dependencies for national security, not only in the military sphere, but also in the socio-economic, information, financial, etc.<sup>276</sup>.

#### **CONCLUSIONS**

Hybrid warfare is a "new" form of confrontation between states that, unlike traditional wars, does not necessarily require the use of military force, or the destruction of their infrastructure to achieve political goals, but through economic, and financial sanctions, and information psychology these goals are achieved. Today, the entire theatres of hybrid war operations are deliberately created, which geographically include strategically important regions of Eastern Europe, the Arctic, Transcaucasia, Ukraine, and along the so-called crisis arc, covering the area from the Sahel to Central Asia.

The hybrid war strategy is aimed at: defeating the enemy by causing him losses on all fronts, mainly: information, economic, military, diplomatic. It is

199

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>275</sup>Extrapolation - predicting the course of a phenomenon under unknown conditions on the basis of knowledge of an analogous phenomenon under known conditions. *Dictionary of the Polish Language*, https://sjp.pwn.pl/sjp/ekstrapolacja;2556323.html, access: 08.10.2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>276</sup> Războaie hibride în clasificarea căruțelor. Războiul hibrid ca un nou tip de război al viitorului. Natura nestatală a războiului hibrid, op. cit.

a path to victory in a new type of conflict that may have a significant, and sometimes decisive influence on the development of contemporary, and future security for many decades to come. In turn, preparing an effective response to hybrid threats requires dialogue, and cooperation both at the political, and operational level, and at the level of the affected countries, between institutions responsible for guaranteeing security, on the regional, and global level. Actions taken must aim at raising awareness of the threat, and increasing the resilience of the society, infrastructure, and institutions by identifying the best forms of defence, and security. To increase resistance to a threat, it is important to understand its nature, recognize the vulnerabilities that your opponent can take advantage of. Each country must be aware that it cannot ensure security without strengthening its ability to cooperate, and coordinate in collecting, and exchanging information, as well as identifying, and assessing threats and weaknesses<sup>277</sup>.

Hybrid warfare is developing rapidly, and demonstrates the need to revisit classic military methods in predicting, and planning both offensive, and defensive strategies. Compared to the classic conflict, the hybrid model represents a dynamic interaction between the elements of hard power (strengthening armed forces, deploying armed forces, and capabilities in conflict areas, financing separatist movements, destabilizing, and undermining the security of a state, or region), and soft power (maintaining economic, or energy dependence, using economic sanctions, conducting propaganda campaigns, disinformation, and influencing, carrying out cyberattacks, etc.).

To sum up, the development of research on the strategy of hybrid wars forced states to change the concepts of conflict management presented so far. In addition, intensified research into the hybrid warfare strategy results from the introduction of new war theories based on the need to respond to real threats. All this means that with the beginning of the 21st century there was a global change in the perception of war, taking into account the range of affairs, and threats that each country may face in the future.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>277</sup> Război hibrid și atacuri cibernetice, https://intelligence.sri.ro/razboi-hibrid-si-atacuri-cibernetice/ access: 19.09.2020.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] Balcerowicz B., *Armed forces in a state of peace, crisis, war*, Scholar Academic Publishing, Warsaw 2010.
- [2] Banasik M., *Polish perspective on hybrid war*, "Defence Scientific Papers of the Faculty of Management and Command of the War Studies University" 2016, No. 16.
- [3] Bartosz A. A., *Dialectic of hybrid warfare*, "Philosophical thought "2017, no. 12.
- [4] Bartosz A.A., *Mixed war strategy and counter-strategy*, "Military thought", 2018, *no.10*.
- [5] Boone Bartholomees J., *Theory of War and Strategy*, U.S. Army War College, Carlisle 2010.
- [6] Crimea presented a Russian version of "mixed war", http://military.people.com.cn/BIG5/n1/2020/0409/c1011-31667237.html access: 09.09.2020.
- [7] Der hybride Krieg eine neue Qualität komplexer Kriegführung und multinationaler Bedrohung? Eine Einschätzung der russischen Sicht, https://www.oemz-online.at/display/ZLIintranet/Der+hybride+Krieg, access: 08.10.2020.
- [8] *Dictionary of the Polish Language,* https://sjp.pwn.pl/sjp/ekstrapolacja;2556323.html, access: 08.10.2020.
- [9] Evgheni Mahda: "Specificul unui război hibrid este că lupta se dă nu pentru teritorii, ci pentru mințile și atitudinele cetățenilor altor state, https://moldova.europalibera.org/a/27738877.html access: 12.09.2020.
- [10] Fryc M, *Polish defence strategy against a military threat with elements of "hybrid war"*, "National Security" 2015, No. I.
- [11] Glossary of terms in the field of national security, National Defence University, Warsaw 2008.
- [12] Hoffman F., *Conflict in the 21st Century: The Rise of Hybrid Wars*, Potomac Institute for Policy Studies, Arlington 2007.
- [13] Joint Communication to the European Parliament and the Council Joint Framework to counter hybrid threats the European Union response, JOIN / 2016/018 final

- [14] Koziej S., *The theory of art of warfare*, Bellona Publishing House, Warsaw 2011.
- [15] Kozub M., Mitręga A., *Fundamentals of security strategy. Selected aspects*, Jan Kochanowski University, Kielce 2018.
- [16] Mathams R. H., *The intelligence Analyst's Notebook* [w:] *Strategic Intelligence: Theory and Application*, ed. D. H. Dearth, R.T. Goodden, Washington 1995.
- [17] Mattis J. N., Hoffman F., *Future Warfare: The Rise of Hybrid Wars*, "United States Naval Institute Proceedings", 2005, vol. 131, no. 11.
- [18] Minkina M., The *Art of Intelligence in a Contemporary State,* Bellona, Warsaw 2014.
- [19] Mixed War: Unprecedented Integration, http://www.xinhuanet.com/mil/2019-05/23/c\_1210142001.htm, access: 03.08.2020.
- [20] Nemeth W. J., *Future war and Chechnya: A case for hybrid warfare*, http://calhoun.nps.edu/bitstream/handle/10945/5865/02Jun\_Neme th.pdf?sequence=1, access: 12.09.2020.
- [21] Niedźwiecki R., *Evolution of strategy. Towards an integrated security strategy*, National Defence University, Warsaw 2013.
- [22] Nożko K., *The issues of contemporary art of warfare,* Publishing House of the Ministry of National Defence, Warsaw 1973.
- [23] Pokruszyński W., *Politics and security strategy,* Alcide De Gasperi University of Euroregional Economy, Józefów 2011.
- [24] Polak A., Strategy, i.e. about the border between the art of warfare and politics, "Kwartalnik Bellona" 2013, No. 1.
- [25] Războaie hibride în clasificarea căruțelor. Războiul hibrid ca un nou tip de război al viitorului. Natura nestatală a războiului hibrid, https://srcaltufevo.ru/ro/gibridnye-voiny-v-klassifikacii-vozgibridnaya-voina-kak-novyi-tip-voiny.html, access: 05.05.2020.
- [26] *Război hibrid și atacuri cibernetice*, https://intelligence.sri.ro/razboi-hibrid-si-atacuri-cibernetice/, access: 19.09.2020.
- [27] Skoneczny Ł., *Hybrid warfare a challenge of the future? Selected issues,* "Internal Security Review, Special edition, 2015.
- [28] Was sind hybride Bedrohungen?, https://www.bmvg.de/de/themen/sicherheitspolitik/hybride-

- bedrohungen/was-sind-hybride-bedrohungen--13692, access: 25.09.2020.
- [29] Герасимов В., *Ценность науки в предвидении*, https://www.vpk-news.ru/articles/14632, access: 03.05.2020.
- [30] Две модели организации тыла, https://strateg.org/dve-modeliorganizacii-tyla.html, access: 24.10.2020.
- [31] Основы военной стратегии и большой стратегии, http://militera.lib.ru/science/liddel\_hart1/19.html, access: 14.09.2020.
- [32] Фененко А., *Какими будут войны будущего?*, https://globalaffairs.ru/articles/kakimi-budut-vojny-budushhego/, access: 03.05.2020.
- [33] Хаос вооруженного противоборства. Рациональное и иррациональное в стратегии гибридной войны, http://blackseafleet-21.com/news/18-07-2019\_haos-vooruzhennogo-protivoborstva-ratsionalnoe-i-irratsionalnoe-v-strategii-gibridnoj-voj, access: 20.08.2020.

# STRATEGIA W PROWADZENIU WOJEN HYBRYDOWYCH W XXI WIEKU

#### **STRESZCZENIE**

W ciągu ostatniej dekady koncepcja wojny hybrydowej wzbudziła duże zajmującej zainteresowanie światowej społeczności się problematyka bezpieczeństwa, zarówno militarnego, jak i pozamilitarnego. Specyfika wojny hybrydowej polega na tym, że walka nie toczy się o terytoria, ale o umysły i postawy obywateli innych państw, a środki walki są bardzo wyrafinowane. Każda wojna hybrydowa opiera się na strategii, która zakłada osiągnięcie zwycięstwa poprzez wyznaczanie celów, ogólny plan i systematyczne oddziaływanie na podatności wroga przy użyciu kompleksu zagrożeń hybrydowych. W związku z powyższym, celem artykułu jest przedstawienie roli jaką pełni strategia w prowadzeniu wojny hybrydowej, a także w opracowaniu mechanizmów przeciwdziałania zagrożeniom hybrydowym.

Słowa kluczowe: wojna hybrydowa, strategia, kontrstrategia